

‘Other habits’ and ‘other places’: Ninagawa’s *Twelfth Night*

Richard J. HODSON

要 約

『NINAGAWA 十二夜』は、演出家蜷川幸雄にとって、最初の冒険であり、シェイクスピア劇の最初の歌舞伎化でもあった。歌舞伎劇場の壮大な可能性を活かして、蜷川は観客を舞台に引き込み、演劇の世界へ誘う。この作品では2人の役者に複数の役を演じさせることによって、この喜劇の二重性(doubleness)を物理的に表現しようと試みている。本稿では、この試みが原作の構成上の制約によって制限される度合、また蜷川が原作から離れることによって『十二夜』にかなりの新しい解釈をもたらしている点を考察する。

Abstract

Ninagawa Yukio’s kabuki adaptation of *Twelfth Night* was both the director’s first venture, and the first use of a Shakespeare play, in kabuki. By exploiting the spectacular possibilities of the kabuki theatre, Ninagawa brings the audience onto the stage, and into the world of the play. By casting two of the actors in multiple roles, the production attempts to represent the thematic doubleness of the comedy in physical form. This paper will examine the extent to which this attempt is restricted by the structure of the original play; and the way in which Ninagawa’s departures from it lead to a substantial reinterpretation of *Twelfth Night*.

Ninagawa Yukio’s kabuki adaptation of Shakespeare’s *Twelfth Night* – referred to hereafter as *Juniya* – was originally staged at the Kabukiza in Tokyo between 7 and 31 July 2005, and was revived at the Hakataza in Fukuoka between 5 and 28 June 2007. In a 2005 interview with Tanaka Nobuko in *The Japan Times*, Ninagawa revealed that the inspiration for the adaptation came not from himself, but from the lead actor, Onoe Kikunosuke, and that his own initial reaction to the proposed project was not one of immediate enthusiasm:

.... last year he asked me to direct this kabuki “Twelfth Night.” Kikunosuke is a really earnest guy and I was moved by his zest for this project. That was the only reason that I overcame my long-term hesitation After I said yes to Kikunosuke, I kept thinking “I do not want to do this, I do not want to do it.” Honestly, it was a real bother for me.¹

The play itself was not new to Ninagawa, as he had first directed *Twelfth Night* in 1998, and has since staged a further three Shakespearean comedies: *A Midsummer Night’s Dream*, *The Comedy of Errors*, and *Love’s Labours Lost*, in a directing career that now encompasses thirteen plays by Shakespeare in the full spectrum of genres,

¹ Tanaka Nobuko, ‘The Bard on the hanamichi’, *The Japan Times* (20 July 2005).

after an early emphasis on tragedy.² Sasaguchi Rei, writing in the same edition of *The Japan Times*, notes that the production represents 'three firsts for the kabuki world: the first time the popular young Kikunosuke initiated a production, the first time Ninagawa directed a kabuki performance and the first time kabuki has used a Western story'.³ The kabuki *Juniya* must be seen, therefore, as a collaboration, and a multiple one at that: inspired by Kikunosuke and directed by Ninagawa; but working from a script by Imai Toyoshige, adapted from a Japanese translation of *Twelfth Night* by Odashima Yushi.⁴ This collaborative nature has significant implications for its status as an adaptation of *Twelfth Night*, and for the light that it sheds on the themes and structure of one of Shakespeare's greatest comedies, in both of its main plots.

Twelfth Night is one of the few Shakespeare plays for which we have a relatively detailed record of its first – or at least, earliest known – performance, in the hall of the Middle Temple, one of the Inns of Court in the City of London, on 2 February 1602. The play was attended by John Manningham, a law student, who left a record of the performance in his diary:

At our feast we had a play called "Twelfth Night, or What You Will", much like "The Comedy of Errors" or "Menaechmi" in Plautus, but most like and near to that in Italian called "Inganni". A good practice in it to make the steward believe his lady-widow was in love with him, by counterfeiting a letter as from his lady, in general terms telling him what she liked best in him and prescribing his gesture in smiling, his apparel, etc. and then, when he came to practice, making him believe they took him for mad.

Manningham's comments, brief as they are, are of considerable interest in the light they shed both on contemporary reaction to the play, and on the identification of its sources and influences. Manningham focuses primarily on the details of the Malvolio plot, but his references to Shakespeare's own *The Comedy of Errors*, the *Menaechmi* of Plautus, and the Italian 'Inganni', show him to have been an informed and alert theatre-goer, and one who also paid attention to the Viola plot. The 'Inganni' is *Gl'Ingannati* by Gl'Intronnati of Siena.⁵ The heroine of this play, Lelia, disguises herself as a boy in the service of a young nobleman called Flamminio, with whom she is in love, and who had previously returned her affection, but who now sends her as his envoy to Isabella, who falls in love with her. The arrival in Modena of Lelia's brother Fabrizio, long separated from his family by events succeeding the sack of Rome in 1527, precipitates a farcical denouement in which the fathers of Lelia and Isabella contrive to have Fabrizio locked into a room with Isabella, believing him to be the disguised Lelia. M. M. Mahood characterizes *Gl'Ingannati* as 'a heartless work; a bright, bustling, and often salacious comedy of intrigue',⁶ and its tone is indeed different to that of *Twelfth Night*. Rather closer in spirit to Shakespeare's comedy is Barnaby Rich's romance, 'Apolonius and Silla', an adaptation of a tale by Bandello, and one of the major English sources of *Twelfth Night*.⁷ In this story, Silla, the daughter of the governor of

² Ninagawa Yukio, 'Works', <<http://www.my-pro.co.jp/ninagawa/work.html>>.

³ Sasaguchi Rei, 'Shakespeare as never before', *The Japan Times* (20 July 2005).

⁴ William Shakespeare, *Twelfth Night*, translated by Odashima Yushi (Tokyo: Hakusui U Books, 1983).

⁵ Translated as *The Deceived*, in *Five Italian Renaissance Comedies*, ed. Bruce Penman (Harmondsworth, Middlesex: Penguin, 1978).

⁶ Introduction to *Twelfth Night*, ed. M. M. Mahood (Harmondsworth, Middlesex: Penguin, 1978), p. 26. References to and quotations from *Twelfth Night* are from this edition.

⁷ 'Apolonius and Silla' is one of eight stories in Rich's *Farewell to Militarie Profession* (1581).

Cyprus, is shipwrecked at Constantinople, and disguises herself as a man – calling herself after her brother, Silvio – in order to serve the duke of Constantinople, Apolonius, with whom she is already in love. Apolonius sends her as a messenger to the widow Julina, with whom he is himself in love; and Julina falls in love with this supposed Silvio, who rejects her advances. Meeting with a more favourable reception from the real Silvio on his arrival in Constantinople – the brother and sister are ‘so like the other, in countenance and fauor, that there was no man able to descerne the one from the other by their face’ – Julina becomes pregnant, and is threatened with shame and disgrace until the confusion is resolved first of all by Silla’s revelation of her physical ‘impediment’ to Julina, and eventually by the return of the real, remorseful Silvio. The story ends with the marriages of Apolonius and Silla, and Julina and Silvio.

While the romantic tone of *Twelfth Night* – including the device of the shipwreck – owes more to ‘Apolonius and Silla’ than to *Gl’Ingannati*, the Italian comedy does, like Shakespeare’s, contain a larger cast of minor characters than Rich’s romance, including squabbling, witty servants. None of them leads directly to the Malvolio plot of *Twelfth Night*, although some fun is had at the expense of Lelia’s would-be husband Gherardo (himself the father of Isabella), who is encouraged early in the play (Act I) to change his style of dress to make himself more appealing to his young bride-to-be, and thereupon determines to ‘devote [his] whole life to love’;⁸ the ridiculousness of these pretensions are then commented upon by his servant. Although, however, the Viola plot dominates the play’s sources, it does not dominate the play. *Twelfth Night* is a comedy with two parallel plots, not with a plot and a sub-plot.

With its double plot, and its use of twins at the centre of its story – something in which it goes beyond its sources: Lelia and Fabrizio, and Silla and Silvio, are siblings, but not twins – *Twelfth Night* is clearly a play about doubleness, in the form both of opposites, and of halves of a whole.⁹ Viola and Sebastian are the most obvious example, but Viola and Olivia are also a pair – both mourning for a lost brother – as are Viola/Cesario and Orsino, both in love with a seemingly unattainable object. The two onstage couples at the close of the play represent a resolution of the sexual confusions engendered by the cross-dressing story, to the extent that, not only do we see the restoration of one brother/sister couple, and the clarification of the ‘bias’ of ‘nature’ in providing a female Cesario (Viola) for Orsino, and a male Cesario (Sebastian) for Olivia,¹⁰ but also the creation of multiple new pairs of siblings:

Olivia My lord, so please you, these things further thought on,
To think me as well a sister as a wife,
One day shall crown th’ alliance on’t, so please you,
Here at my house, and at my proper cost.

⁸ *The Deceived*, p. 212.

⁹ Jonathan Bate, writing in the programme of a 2005-2006 RSC production of *Twelfth Night* (London: RSC, 2005), draws an analogy between Shakespeare’s comic twins, and the cut-in-half androgyne of Plato’s *Symposium*.

¹⁰ For a more detailed examination of the workings of this ‘general force’, see C. L. Barber, *Shakespeare’s Festive Comedy* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1959). Barber also suggests that the ‘temporary, playful reversal of sexual roles’ in the play is part of a movement towards a comic re-establishment of norms, which conveys ‘how much the sexes differ yet how much they have in common, how everyone who is fully alive has qualities of both’ (pp. 245, 247).

Orsino Madam, I am most apt t'embrace your offer.
 (To *Viola*) Your master quits you; and for your service done him
 So much against the mettle of your sex,
 So far beneath your soft and tender breeding,
 And since you called me master for so long,
 Here is my hand; you shall from this time be
 Your master's mistress.

Olivia A sister, you are she.

[*TN*, V.1, 313-23]

These structural pairings are reinforced by the verse at the heart of V.1, in the echoing exchange by which Viola and Sebastian confirm their identities, momentarily doubling each other, and their families, before the single identity of Viola can resolved: 'I had a sister Sebastian was my brother My father had a mole upon his brow And so had mine' (V.1, 223-45).

Viola and Orsino, and Sebastian and Olivia, are not the only couples brought together at the end of *Twelfth Night*, as Sir Toby has married Maria 'in recompense' for her part in the gulling of Malvolio, a fact reported to us by Fabian (V.1, 362). There are, though, a number of would-be couples for whom *Twelfth Night* provides no pairing-off, romantic or otherwise. Antonio is left without Sebastian, and indeed his final act of the play is to be first recognised by him, and then immediately – albeit understandably – passed over in favour of Viola. Sir Andrew Aguecheek is left without either his hopes of Olivia, or his companion Sir Toby, who rejects him to his face as 'An asshead, and a coxcomb, and a knave – a thin-faced knave, a gull!' (V.1, 203-04). Malvolio is stripped of his fantasy of leaving his bride of three months, Olivia, sleeping on 'a day-bed' (II.5, 47); and then we have the un-paired: Feste, and even Fabian. These unresolved elements are accompanied by a number of other tensions and hints of melancholy, such as the shaming of Malvolio, seen by many as excessive, and verging even on the cruel; and the awareness of decay, aging and death that permeates songs and speeches by Feste and Viola. Many of these elements can be seen as transpositions of the imprisonment and humiliation motifs that must be resolved by the romantic conclusion of 'Apolonius and Silla'. Together they make *Twelfth Night* what one critic has called a 'strange, sad play'.¹¹ Yet it is, at the same time, 'justly considered as one of the most delightful of Shakespeare's comedies full of sweetness and pleasantry',¹² a play composed of

the very stuff of European comedy: two fairyland courts made of fantasies of love, a singing melancholy fool, below-stairs frolics with a dim-witted gull and a drunken knight making a comic pair, a pert maid, a repressive steward, and above all the parted identical twins.¹³

Ninagawa's kabuki *Juniya* omits none of these elements, but recasts them in a setting that is traditionally Japanese rather than European, complete with kimonos, cherry trees in bloom, 'kogetsudai' ('moon-viewing

¹¹ David Daniell, 'Shakespeare and the traditions of comedy', in *The Cambridge Companion to Shakespeare Studies*, ed. Stanley Wells (Cambridge: CUP, 1986), p. 115.

¹² William Hazlitt, in *Characters of Shakespeare's Plays* (1817).

¹³ Daniell, p. 115.

cones' made of sand) and wooden bridges arching over pools of lilies. For the most part, its plot and characters mirror those in *Twelfth Night*, with the characters given names that either sound like Japanized versions of the Shakespearean original, such as Oribue for Olivia, or represent a Japanese equivalent of a concept seen in the original name: the hint of 'viol' in Viola leads us to 'biwa', a Japanese lute, and hence to the character of Princess Biwa. The table in Appendix I summarises these correspondences.¹⁴

Despite the great similarities, though, and in contrast to the views of some critics – Sasaguchi Rei, for example, describes it as 'faithful to the original', and the reviewer for *Web Japan* writes that the production is 'based on a faithfully translated script'¹⁵ – *Juniya* is not simply *Twelfth Night* in a Japanese setting. Ninagawa himself has argued that the production 'is actually carried out very closely to Shakespeare's original, with the exception of the changes made to enable Kikugoro to play the two roles of Malvolio and Feste',¹⁶ but the extent of this 'very' is open to question. Two sentences later in the same interview, Ninagawa goes on to cite another change: the use of one actor – Kikunosuke – to play what he describes as 'the three roles of Sebastian, Viola and Cesario'.¹⁷ Kikunosuke's role in inspiring the whole production is clearly an important factor in this alteration, the implications of which, however, may not be unique to this particular production. Benito Ortolani argues that:

Since its beginnings kabuki has been appreciated as an 'actor's theatre' in which performance has traditionally overridden in importance considerations of literary value or scenic effect. Everything in kabuki is centered on the bravura of the star, in the service of whom text, costumes, scenery, and music are orchestrated for maximum effect.¹⁸

To what extent is *Juniya* open to this charge? The first scene of Ninagawa's production is identical to I.1 of *Twelfth Night*, but the following scene immediately takes us away from Shakespeare's text. It is, in fact, a spectacular interpolation set on a ship at sea, which is attacked by pirates, and then hit by a storm, precipitating the separation of the twins, Biwa/Viola and Shuzennosuke/Sebastian, an event narrated by Viola in I.2 of *Twelfth Night*, and retold by Biwa in I.3 of *Juniya*.¹⁹ The interpolation is not without precedent,²⁰ but its use of lighting, sound, and the revolving stage of the kabuki theatre, allows full scope for Kikunosuke to establish his performance as both Biwa and Shuzennosuke, as he performs a number of quick costume changes on board the ship as it revolves. There seems little reason to suggest, though, that 'performance' overrides other considerations in this particular scene. As *Juniya* progresses, Kikunosuke's dual role becomes a triple one, as Biwa disguises herself as Shishimaru, allowing the 'bravura of the star' to shine under conventions of performance that resemble, but do not precisely duplicate, those of the original *Twelfth Night*. Viola/Cesario is

¹⁴ Mark Oshima, 'Ninagawa "Twelfth Night"' [theatrical programme] (Fukuoka: Hakataza Theater, 2007), p. 2.

¹⁵ Sasaguchi, *op cit*; *Web Japan*. 'Kabuki meets Shakespeare', <<http://web-japan.org/trends/arts/art050811.html>> 11 August 2005.

¹⁶ In an August 2005 interview with *Performing Arts Network Japan*, 'What is the Kabuki version Twelfth Night? Yukio Ninagawa's new challenge', <http://www.performingarts.jp/E/art_interview/0508/1.html>, p. 2.

¹⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 2.

¹⁸ Benito Ortolani, *The Japanese Theatre: From Shamanistic Ritual to Contemporary Pluralism* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1990), p. 187.

¹⁹ References to act and scene divisions in *Juniya* are to Oshima, pp. 3-7.

²⁰ Trevor Nunn's 1996 film adaptation of *Twelfth Night*, for example, opens with an original shipboard/storm scene.

a female character, pretending to be a man, and acted by a boy; Biwa/Shuzennosuke is also a female character, also pretending to be a man, but acted by an *onnagata*: a mature male kabuki actor, who specialises in playing female roles. Kikunosuke exploits this convention-driven sexual disorientation to considerable comic effect, particularly through deployment of his vocal skills, the 'female' elocution of the *onnagata* occasionally breaking out and threatening to betray Shishimaru's true nature as Biwa, for example.²¹

Although, however, Kikunosuke's dual role as Biwa and Shuzennosuke allows him scope to demonstrate his acting skills, this scope is not without its limits, imposed by the structure of *Juniya*, and of *Twelfth Night* itself. Even the most versatile of actors cannot be in two places at once, and this is what the final scene of the Shakespeare's comedy demands, as Viola and Sebastian meet, recognise each other, and remain on stage together from halfway through V.1, until Feste's song brings the play to a close. *Juniya* chooses to retain the structure of *Twelfth Night* at this point, although the order of entrances and exits is altered: Kikunosuke's Shuzennosuke is joined on stage midway through III.6 by a substitute actor playing Shishimaru, who is then recognised, and sent off-stage so that Biwa can return in her 'woman's weeds'. Ninagawa's answer to Antonio's question, 'How have you made division of yourself?', is physically represented on stage by the simultaneous appearance of two characters previously played by one actor, maintaining the thematic integrity of the drama. However, as a solution to the staging problems posed by the double casting of Kikunosuke, and despite the best efforts of costume, make-up and acting style to make it as precise a duplication as possible – 'One face, one voice, one habit, and two persons' – the substitution cannot help but come as something of a disappointment to the audience, albeit an unavoidable one.

The Biwa plot is not, though, the only doubling in *Juniya*. The enormous wall of mirrors that forms the whole stage backdrop at the opening of the play, and which reappears during its action – most notably in the lily-garden encounter between Oribue and Shuzennosuke, and for the departure of Sutesuke at the close – is the most spectacular innovation of the production, eliciting gasps from the Hakataza audience as it was revealed at the beginning of Act I. It is not, however, merely spectacular. The first thing seen by the *Juniya* audience is – unexpectedly – itself, on the stage. This is one part of Ninagawa's intention for the audience 'to confuse reality and drama',²² and as such it acts as a further reinforcement of the doubleness of *Twelfth Night*; what Terence Hawkes refers to as the 'benign duplicity' advanced by the play's 'interactive relationship with its audience this interactive, carnivalesque, oral-aural duplicity':

The theatre itself links the world the actor inhabits on the stage with the one we inhabit in the auditorium: his world 'doubles' or mirrors ours²³

²¹ This particular theatrical technique was popular in nineteenth-century productions of *Twelfth Night*, according to Mahood, pp. 33-34, until increasing awareness of 'the anachronism of a swaggering and gruff-toned actress' playing Viola/Cesario led to more natural modern interpretations of the part, which was originally played by a boy with 'maiden pipe' – although we cannot be sure, of course, that contemporary boy actors playing Viola playing Cesario did not attempt a more masculine elocution. Ninagawa himself is clearly not averse to the technique: Togashi Makoto, the actress playing Viola, uses it in his 1998 Saitama production of *Twelfth Night*, allowing her voice to slip occasionally into the female register.

²² Tanaka, *op cit*.

²³ Terence Hawkes, 'Comedy, Orality and Duplicity: *Twelfth Night*', in *Shakespeare's Comedies*, ed. Gary Waller (Harlow, Essex: Longman, 1991), p. 173.

and this is certainly true of the staging of *Juniya*. Audience involvement is not the only achievement of the mirror-wall, though; it also serves to ‘double’ the characters on the stage at crucial moments – particularly Oribue in the garden scene – and to both extend the potential, and make up for the shortcomings of the stage itself. The modern kabuki theatre is based around a wide, proscenium stage which, in Ninagawa’s view ‘is usually so two-dimensional’²⁴ – the world of kabuki ‘is basically a flat world’²⁵ – and the mirrored wall, which occasionally becomes transparent, provides a mechanism by which that world can be deepened, and which allows different perspectives on the stage action to be given to viewers sitting in different parts of the auditorium. This use of different perspectives is particularly effective when used in conjunction with one of the defining physical characteristics of the kabuki stage: the *hanamichi*, an elevated walkway that extends from the rear left of the auditorium, through the audience, to the front of the stage, house left. James R. Brandon refers to the ‘phenomenon of gigantism’ in modern kabuki theatre architecture, one result of which is that ‘spectators in the overhanging balconies can no longer see actors on much of the *hanamichi*’.²⁶ Ninagawa’s staging represents a partial solution to this problem, and it is particularly effective in the closing moments of the play, moments which see the departure of Sutesuke, the ‘comic entertainer’ who is the *Juniya* equivalent of Feste in *Twelfth Night*. It is in the treatment of Feste/Sutesuke that Ninagawa’s *Juniya* departs most radically – and perhaps most provocatively – from Shakespeare’s *Twelfth Night*.²⁷

The table in Appendix II below shows scene divisions in both *Twelfth Night* and *Juniya*, and the principal characters that appear in each scene; a number of characters enter, exit, and then enter again in the same scene. Apart from *Juniya*’s interpolated shipwreck scene (*J*, I.2), and the positioning of the two Antonio/Sebastian scenes – Shuzennosuke and Niobei first appear one scene later than their *Twelfth Night* counterparts, and then make their second appearance one scene earlier – the major difference in action occurs between the third and fourth acts of *Twelfth Night*. Ninagawa’s production brings forward the dark house torment of Malvolio (*TN*, IV.2) – which becomes an exorcism in *Juniya* (*J*, III.4) – so that it takes place immediately after Antonio/Niobei has intervened in the fight between Sir Andrew/Eichiku and Viola/Biwa. A number of alterations follow, which compress Shakespeare’s four scenes into three. Ninagawa stages the fight between Sebastian/Shuzennosuke and Sir Andrew/Eichiku – the action which leads directly to one of the two romantic pairings of the Viola plot, and therefore to the play’s denouement – not before but after the gulling of Malvolio/Bodayu; and brings the second encounter between Sebastian/Shuzennosuke and Olivia/Oribue into the beginning of the final scene. The result

²⁴ Tanaka, *op cit.*

²⁵ *Performing Arts Network Japan*, p. 2.

²⁶ James R. Brandon, ‘Kabuki’ in *The Cambridge Guide to World Theatre*, ed. Martin Banham (Cambridge: CUP, 1988), p. 534.

²⁷ Feste in Ninagawa’s 1998 Saitama production of *Twelfth Night* had, more conventionally, remained on stage after the departure of the other characters to sing his closing song, extinguishing the stage-side candles at the same time, before himself leaving the stage. This production made use of a thrust stage, onto which the actors emerged from upstage darkness via two candle-lit walkways – like *hanamichi* in reverse – on which some dialogue occasionally took place. Ninagawa’s interest in putting the audience on stage is hinted at in the startling closing action of this production, in which Feste, at the end of his closing song, is pelted by everyday objects – including plastic bottles, cushions, and a sink plunger – thrown from the auditorium.

is, arguably, a greater concentration of action, increasing the focus on the Biwa/Viola plot and sweeping most of its characters together towards the conclusion. The changes seem to be driven, however, by considerations of casting. Unlike Kikunosuke's dual role as Biwa and Shuzennosuke, though, the double casting here resonates thematically with the existing structure of *Twelfth Night*, without the need to resort to a compromise of staging.

Kikunosuke, as we have seen, could not play both Biwa and Shuzennosuke right through to the conclusion of the play. Viola and Sebastian must be on stage at the same time: their mutual recognition is essential to the comedy – although not to either of its sources²⁸ – as it had been to the earlier *The Comedy of Errors*, and as it would continue to be in Shakespeare's romance-comedies, such as *The Winter's Tale*, and *Pericles*. In *Juniya*, unlike Kikunosuke, Onoe Kikugoro succeeds in playing both Bodayu and Sutesuke throughout: Malvolio and Feste have to share the stage in *Twelfth Night*, but their equivalents in *Juniya* do not have to do so. Ninagawa achieves this by exploiting what we might describe as a structural idiosyncrasy already present in *Twelfth Night*: the character of Fabian, who shares Feste's role in the Malvolio plot from his sudden appearance halfway through the play. His *Juniya* counterpart is Hie Angoro, here not a gentleman of Olivia/Oribue's household, but 'a priest who is one of Kanemichi's cronies'.²⁹ Ninagawa gives Angoro both less, and more to do than Shakespeare's Fabian. He is introduced later (*J*, III.2, as opposed to *TN*, II.5), and he misses the box-tree scene (*TN*, II.5, *J*, II.2), in which Malvolio/Bodayu is tricked into believing that his mistress loves him. His role in III.2 is the same as that of Shakespeare's Fabian (*TN*, III.2), as it is in the following scene, Angoro's position as a 'priest' lending additional motivation to the accusations that Malvolio/Bodayu is possessed. He is then given a major role in the dark house scene, in the guise of an exorcist, taking the part played by Feste (as 'Sir Topas') in *Twelfth Night*; and receives Bodayu's letter to Oribue. His attempt to pass it to Sutesuke in III.5 is forestalled by the sudden appearance of Oshino, and he retains it until it is read out in the final scene, bringing his role back on track – at the very last minute – with that of Fabian. In *Twelfth Night*, of course, Feste retains the letter, until it is snatched from him by Olivia, and given to Fabian to read, at V.1, 298.

These alterations in the role of Fabian/Angoro allow Ninagawa to remove Feste/Sutesuke from all scenes in which Malvolio/Bodayu is present; and therefore allow Kikugoro to play both Sutesuke and Bodayu. As with Kikunosuke, 'the bravura of the star' is given full rein here, but rather than overriding 'considerations of literary value', the manipulation of 'other habits' serves here both to amplify the doubleness of the play as a whole, and to put into concrete form one of its structural pairings. Sutesuke, the comic entertainer, is not permitted to confront Bodayu, the puritanical steward, directly;³⁰ but only because, as a physical stage presence, he *is* Bodayu. They are mutually exclusive: one cannot exist without the other, and therefore, one cannot exist at the same time as the other. Bodayu is the anti-Sutesuke; Sutesuke is the anti-Bodayu. As a result, the world of the

²⁸ Lelia and Fabrizio do not meet on stage at all during the course of *Gl'Ingannati*; Silla and Silvio meet at the end of 'Apolonius and Silla', but at this stage Apolonius and Julina are already aware of the true identity of Silla, who has abandoned her disguise.

²⁹ Oshima, p. 2.

³⁰ Odashima's translation, and Imai's kabuki adaptation of it, both retain the English word 'puritan' in Maria's accusation that Malvolio is 'sometimes a kind of puritan'; *TN*, II.3, 134.

kabuki *Juniya* is a world both more polarised, and more inclusive, than that of *Twelfth Night*. In Shakespeare's play, it is Feste's taunting of Malvolio – 'And thus the whirligig of time brings in his revenges' – that leads to Malvolio's exit, famously vowing that 'I'll be revenged on the whole pack of you';³¹ whereas, in *Juniya*, Sutesuke is not – indeed, cannot be – present for this, and it is Angoro who Bodayu pursues from the stage 'like a vengeful ghost from kabuki'.³² Angoro is the tormentor, an element removed from the more purely festive character of Sutesuke, who returns for the closing moments of the play: 'Finally all couples have been united and Sutesuke reflects on this happy outcome. As the play ends, Sutesuke goes to wander to other places and they all send him off fondly'.³³ This action takes place with Sutesuke on the *hanamichi*, and the other characters on the main stage, but the mirrored rear wall ensures not only that he remains in clear sight throughout, but also that he departs *into* the audience: not only the one seated in the auditorium, but also its counterpart mirrored on stage. Sutesuke's departure is therefore an integrative act: an inclusion, as much as it is an exit. Bodayu, unwilling or unable to forgive his tormentors, excludes himself. Sutesuke is bid farewell, and yet remains in sight. The absence of festivity is to be only a temporary one, and its return is guaranteed, because – the mirror audience is there to show us – the 'other places' to which it will wander are just like those seen on the stage.

In its staging of the audience, and in its use of double casting, allowing its two stars to adopt 'other habits' at different times on the stage, Ninagawa's kabuki *Juniya* represents a spectacular and complex response to the doubleness of Shakespeare's *Twelfth Night*. Where it remains closest to its source, the double casting of Kikunosuke is a bold but inevitably limited attempt to render concrete the 'one face, one voice, one habit, and two persons' of the Viola plot. Where it goes beyond that source, in the portrayal by Kikugoro of both Feste and Malvolio-figures, Ninagawa's *Juniya* becomes an elegant reinterpretation of *Twelfth Night* that simplifies some of its ambiguities, and that emphasises its festive inclusiveness, rather than its potential for melancholy.

³¹ *TN*, V.1, 73-75.

³² Oshima, p. 7.

³³ Oshima, p. 7.

Appendix I

Major characters and actors in *Juniya*, with equivalents in *Twelfth Night*

<i>Twelfth Night</i> character	<i>Juniya</i> character	<i>Juniya</i> actor
Sebastian	Shiba Shuzennosuke	Onoe Kikunosuke
Viola, later disguised as Cesario	Shishimaru, actually Princess Biwa	
Olivia	Princess Oribue	Nakamura Tokizo
Sir Andrew Aguecheek	Udaiben Ando Eichiku	Nakamura Kanjaku
Orsino	Lord Oshino, Minister of the Left	Nakamura Kinnosuke
Maria	Maa, Oribue's maid	Ichikawa Kamejiro
Antonio	Amato Niobei, a pirate who rescues Shuzennosuke	Kawarazaki Gonjuro
Fabian	Hie Angoro, a priest who is one of Kanemichi's cronies	Ichikawa Danzo
Captain	Isoemon, a ship's captain	Ichikawa Danshiro
Sir Toby Belch	Sadaiben Toin Kanemichi, Oribue's dissolute uncle	Ichikawa Sadanji
Malvolio	Maruo Bodayu, Oribue's steward	Onoe Kikugoro
Feste	Sutesuke, a comic entertainer	

Appendix II

Scenes and major character appearances in *Twelfth Night* and *Juniya*

<i>Twelfth Night</i>		<i>Juniya</i>	
I.1	Orsino and attendants	I.1	Oshino and attendants
I.2	Viola, Captain	I.2	Shuzennosuke, Biwa, Isoemon
I.3	Sir Toby, Maria, Sir Andrew	I.3	Biwa, Isoemon
I.4	<i>Viola</i> , Orsino and attendants	I.4	Kanemichi, Maa, Eichiku
I.5	Maria, Feste, Olivia, Malvolio, Sir Toby, <i>Viola</i> ,	I.5	<i>Biwa</i> , Oshino and attendants
II.1	Antonio, Sebastian	I.6	Maa, Sutesuke, Oribue, Bodayu, Kanemichi, <i>Biwa</i>
II.2	<i>Viola</i> , Malvolio	I.7	<i>Biwa</i> , Bodayu
II.3	Sir Toby, Sir Andrews, Feste, Maria, Malvolio	I.8	Shuzennosuke, Niobei
II.4	<i>Viola</i> , Orsino and attendants, Feste	I.9	Kanemichi, Eichiku, Sutesuke, Maa, Bodayu
II.5	Sir Toby, Sir Andrew, Fabian, Maria, Malvolio	II.1	<i>Biwa</i> , Oshino and attendants
III.1	<i>Viola</i> , Feste, Sir Toby, Sir Andrew, Olivia, Maria	II.2	Kanemichi, Eichiku, Maa, Bodayu
III.2	Sir Toby, Sir Andrew, Fabian, Maria	II.3	<i>Biwa</i> , Sutesuke, Kenmichi, Eichiku, Oribue
III.3	Sebastian, Antonio	III.1	Shuzennosuke, Niobei
III.4	Olivia, Maria, Malvolio, Sir Toby, Fabian, Sir Andrew, <i>Viola</i> , Antonio	III.2	Kanemichi, Eichiku, Angoro, Maa
IV.1	Feste, Sebastian, Sir Andrew, Sir Toby, Fabian, Olivia	III.3	Oribue, Maa, Bodayu, Kanemichi, Angoro, Eichiku, <i>Biwa</i> , Niobei
IV.2	Maria, Feste, Sir Toby, Malvolio	III.4	Angoro, Maa, Kanemichi, Bodayu
IV.3	Sebastian, Olivia	III.5	Shuzennosuke, Sutesuke, Eichiku, Kanemichi, Oribue, Angoro, Oshino, <i>Biwa</i> , Niobei
V.1	Feste, Fabian, Orsino, <i>Viola</i> , Antonio, Olivia, Sir Andrew, Sir Toby, Sebastian, Malvolio	III.6	Shuzennosuke, Oribue, Oshino, <i>Biwa</i> , Niobei, Eichiku, Kanemichi, Maa, Angoro, Bodayu, Sutesuke

Italics indicate that Viola and Biwa appear here in disguise as Cesario and Shishimaru, respectively.

Works cited

- Banham, Martin. *The Cambridge Guide to World Theatre*. Cambridge: CUP, 1988.
- Barber, C. L. *Shakespeare's Festive Comedy*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1959.
- Bate, Jonathan. 'An apple cleft in two', in Aspley, Sara and Robson, Helen, eds. '*Twelfth Night*' [theatrical programme]. London: RSC, 2005.
- Daniell, David. 'Shakespeare and the traditions of comedy', in Wells, Stanley, ed. *The Cambridge Companion to Shakespeare Studies*. Cambridge: CUP, 1986.
- Gl'Intronati. *The Deceived*, in Penman, Bruce, ed. *Five Italian Renaissance Comedies*. Harmondsworth, Middlesex: Penguin, 1978.
- Hawkes, Terence. 'Comedy, Orality and Duplicity: *Twelfth Night*', in Waller, Gary, ed. *Shakespeare's Comedies*. Harlow, Essex: Longman, 1991.
- Hazlitt, William. *Characters of Shakespeare's Plays*. London, 1817.
<<http://www.gutenberg.org/dirs/etext04/chrsh10.txt>> accessed 25 September 2007.
- Ninagawa, Yukio. 'Works'. <<http://www.my-pro.co.jp/ninagawa/work.html>> accessed 10 August 2007.
- Ortolani, Benito. *The Japanese Theatre: From Shamanistic Ritual to Contemporary Pluralism*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1990.
- Oshima, Mark. 'Ninagawa "Twelfth Night"' [theatrical programme]. Fukuoka: Hakataza Theater, 2007.
- Performing Arts Network Japan*. 'What is the Kabuki version Twelfth Night? Yukio Ningawa's new challenge'. <http://www.performingarts.jp/E/art_interview/0508/1.html> accessed 6 September 2007.
- Rich, Barnaby. 'Apolonius and Silla', in *Farewell to Militarie Profession*. London, 1581.
<<http://www.bibliomania.com/0/5/94/207/15378/1/frameset.html>> accessed 4 September 2007.
- Sasaguchi, Rei. 'Shakespeare as never before'. *The Japan Times*, 20 July 2005.
- Shakespeare, William. *Twelfth Night*. Mahood, M. M., ed. Harmondsworth, Middlesex: Penguin, 1978.

Shakespeare, William. *Twelfth Night*. Odashima, Yushi, trans. Tokyo: Hakusui U Books, 1983.

Tanaka, Nobuko. 'The Bard on the hanamichi'. *The Japan Times*, 20 July 2005.

Web Japan. 'Kabuki meets Shakespeare'. <<http://web-japan.org/trends/arts/art050811.html>>
11 August 2005, accessed 14 September 2007.

Performances cited

Ninagawa Juniya. Ninagawa, Yukio, dir. Kabukiza, Tokyo: 7 to 31 July 2005; revived Hakataza, Fukuoka: 5 June to 28 June 2007.

Ninagawa x Shakespeare: Twelfth Night. Ninagawa, Yukio, dir. Saitama Geijutsu Gekijō, Saitama: October 1998. [DVD: Horipro, 2004].

Twelfth Night. Nunn, Trevor, dir. 1996. [DVD: Entertainment in Video, 2001].

hodson@tc.nagasaki-gaigo.ac.jp